BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04855 5957

CONTEMPORARY ISSUES IN FEDERALISM: THE FUTURE OF THE FEDERATION

2000 – 2001

VOLUME II

Prof. Sujit Choudhry

Faculty of Law,
University of Toronto

Special thanks to Rebecca Case, Allyn Chudy and Carol Wilton for their assistance in the preparation of these materials.

NOV 23 2000
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CONTEMPORARY ISSUES IN FEDERALISM: THE FUTURE OF THE FEDERATION

2000 — 2001

VOLUME II

Prof. Sujit Choudhry

Faculty of Law,
University of Toronto

Special thanks to Rebecca Case, Allyn Chudy and Carol Wilton for their assistance in the preparation of these materials.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/contemporaryissu02chou

CONTEMPORARY ISSUES IN FEDERALISM: THE FUTURE OF THE FEDERATION

2000—2001

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

I. NORMATIVE JUSTIFICATIONS FOR FEDERALISM

No readings

II. SOCIAL POLICY

A. The New Deal Cases

J. H. Thompson with A. Seager, *Canada 1922-1939: Decades of Discord* Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1985) at 261-66. 1

Reference re Employment and Social Insurance Act, [1936] S.C.R. 427. 4

Reference re Employment and Social Insurance Act, [1937] A.C. 355 (P.C.). 19

B. The Post-War Welfare State

K. Banting, "The Past Speaks to the Future: Lessons from the Postwar Social Union" in H. Lazar, ed., *Non-Constitutional Renewal* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1998) 39 at 39-48 and 50-61. 21

C. The Constitution and Social Policy

1. Federal Spending Power

(a) Cases

Porter v. Canada, [1965] 1 Ex. C.R. 200. 31

Central Mortgage and Housing Corp v. Co-op College Residences (1975), 13 O.R. (2d) 384 (C.A.). 38

Winterhaven Stables v. Canada (1988), 53 D.L.R. (4th) 413 (Alta C.A.). 45

Shubenacadie Indian Band v. Canada (Human Rights Commission), [1998] 2 F.C. 198 (T.D.). 62

YMHA Jewish Community Centre v. Brown, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 1532. 66

Reference Re Canada Assistance Plan, [1991] 2 S.C.R. 525. 71

(b) Constitutional provisions and proposals

Constitution Act, 1982, s. 36. 87

Meech Lake Accord of 1987, Schedule, s. 7 (to insert proposed s. 106A into the *Constitution Act, 1867*). 87

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, s. 16 (to insert proposed s. 106A into the *Constitution Act, 1867*) 87

(c) Commentary

P. E. Trudeau, *Federal-Provincial Grants and the Spending Power of Parliament* (Ottawa: Queens Printer, 1969) at 4-34. 88

A. Petter, "Federalism and the Myth of the Federal Spending Power" (1989) 68 Can. Bar Rev. 448. 96

P. W. Hogg, Constitutional Law of Canada (Toronto: Carswell, 1999) at 159-163. 111

Coyne, "The Meech Lake Accord and the Spending Power Proposals: Fundamentally Flawed" in M. D. Behiels, ed., *The Meech Lake Primer: Conflicting Views of the 1987 Constitutional Accord* (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1989) at 245-267. 113

2. Intergovernmental Agreements

(a) Cases

Reference Re Canada Assistance Plan (above)

Saskatchewan Egg Producers Marketing Board v. Ontario (Min. of Agriculture & Food), [1993] O.J. No. 434 (Gen. Div.). 124

Finlay v. Minister of Finance (Standing), [1986] 2 S.C.R. 607. 131

Finlay v. Minister of Finance (Merits), [1993] 1 S.C.R. 1080. 141

Brown v. British Columbia (Attorney General) (1997), 41 B.C.L.R. (3d) 265 (S.C.). 162

Collett v. Ontario (A.G.) (1995), 124 D.L.R. (4th) 426 (Ont. Gen. Div.). 168

Lofstrom v. Murphy (1971), 22 D.L.R. (3d) 120 (Sask. C.A.). 176

(b) Relevant constitutional provisions

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, s. 17 (to insert proposed s. 126A into the *Constitution Act, 1867*) 178

(c) Commentary

S. Choudhry, "Bill 11, the *Canada Health Act* and the Social Union: The Need for Institutions" (2000) 38 Osgoode Hall L.J. 39 at 39-76. 179

3. Impact of the *Charter*

R. v. S.S., [1990] 2 S.C.R. 254. 212

Haig v. Canada (Chief Electoral Officer), [1993] 2 S.C.R. 995. 218

B. Toward a New Social Union?

1. Constitutional Proposals

Ontario's Proposal for a Social Charter for Canada (February 13, 1992) 231

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, ss. 30 (to amend s. 36 of the *Constitution Act, 1982*), 31 (to insert a new s. 36.1, 36.2, 37, and 37.1 into the *Constitution Act, 1982*) 232

A Framework to Improve the Social Union for Canadians (February 4, 1999) 233

First Ministers' Meeting Communiqué on Health (Sept. 11, 2000) 241

2. Commentary

T. J. Courchene, *ACCESS: A Convention on the Canadian Economic and Social Systems* (working paper prepared for the Ontario Ministry of Intergovernmental Affairs, 1996) 247

M. Biggs, *Building Blocks for Canada's New Social Union*, Canadian Policy Research Networks Working Paper No. F02, 39-43 (1996) 265

K. O'Hara with the assistance of S. Cox, *Securing the Social Union*, Canadian Policy Research Networks Study No. CPRN02, 53-67 (1998) 268

W. B.P. Robson & D. Schwanen, *Social Union Agreement: Too Flawed to Last* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, (1999) 278

III. ECONOMIC POLICY

A. Economic Union

1. The case for Economic Union

(a) The Value of Economic Union

J.R.S. Prichard with J. Benedickson, "Securing the Canadian Economic Union: Federalism and Internal Barriers to Trade" in M.J. Trebilcock et al., eds., *Federalism and the Canadian Economic Union* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983) 3 at 5-15. 1

Government of Canada, *Canadian Federalism and Economic Union: Partnership for Prosperity* (Ottawa: Minster of Supply and Services, 1991) at 2 and 9-14..... 6

R. J. Howse, *Economic Union, Social Justice, and Constitutional Reform: Towards a High But Level Playing Field* (North York, ON: York University Centre for for Public Law and Public Policy, 1992) at 7-16..... 12

D. Schneiderman, "Economic Citizenship and Deliberative Democracy: An Inquiry into Constitutional Limitations on Economic Regulation" (1993) 21 Queen's L.J. 125 at 125-130, 141-146 and 151-165. 18

K. Swinton, "Courting Out Way to Economic Integration: Judicial Review and the Canadian Economic Union" (1995) 25 Can Bus. L.J. 280 at 288-293..... 32

(b) Positive vs. Negative Integration

Howse, *Economic Union, Social Justice, and Constitutional Reform: Towards a High But Level Playing Field* at 25-29. 35

M. J. Trebilcock & Rambood Behboodi, "The Canadian Agreement on Internal Trade: Retrospects and Prospects" in M.J. Trebilcock & D. Schwanen, eds., *Getting There: An Assessment of the Agreement on Internal Trade* (Toronto, C.D. Howe Institute, 1995) 20 at 33-39. 37

(c) Barriers to Economic Mobility: The Evidence and Examples

J. Walley, "The Impact of Federal Policies on Interprovincial Activity" in M.J. Trebilcock et al., eds., *Federalism and the Canadian Economic Union* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983) 201 at 217-22. 40

Michael J. Trebilcock et al., "Provincial Induced Barriers to Trade in Canada: A Survey", in M.J. Trebilcock et al., eds., *Federalism and the Canadian Economic Union* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983) 243 at 254-257, 274-279 and 291-294. 43

2. The Constitution and Economic Policy

(a) Federal Jurisdiction

(i) Trade and Commerce

Interprovincial and International Trade

Labatt Breweries v. A.G. Canada, [1980] 1 S.C.R. 914. 48

General Regulation of Trade Affecting the Whole Dominion

General Motors v. City National Leasing, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 641. 60

(ii) Peace, Order and Good Government (POGG)

R. v. Crown Zellerbach Canada Ltd. 49 D.L.R. (4th) 161 73

(b) Provincial Jurisdiction: Property & Civil Rights

Carnation Co. v. Quebec Agricultural Marketing Board, [1968] S.C.R. 238. 86

A.G. Manitoba v. Manitoba Egg & Poultry Assoc., [1971] S.C.R. 689. 90

Central Canada Potash v. Government of Saskatchewan, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 42 97

3. Interprovincial Mobility

(a) Constitutional Provisions

Constitution Act, 1867, s. 121. 101

Constitution Act, 1982, 22. 6(2)-(4) 101

(b) Goods, Capital & Services

Atlantic Smoke Shops, [1943] A.C. 550 102

Murphy v. CPR, [1958] S.C.R. 626 105

Re Agricultural Products Marketing Act, [1978] 2 S.C.R. 1198 110

(c) Persons: Mobility Rights

Law Society of Upper Canada v. Skapinker, [1984] 1 S.C.R. 357 115

Black v. Law Society of Alberta, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 591 121

Canadian Egg Marketing Board v. Richardson, [1998] 3 S.C.R. 157 136

Waldman v. British Columbia (Medical Services Commission) (1997), 177 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (B.C.C.A.) 163

4. Towards the Canadian Economic Union

(a) Agreement on Internal Trade

D. Schwanen, "Canadian Regardless of Origin: 'Negative Integration' and the Agreement on Internal Trade" in H. Lazar, ed., *Non-Constitutional Renewal* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1998) 169 175

D. Schwanen, "Happy Birthday, AIT!" (2000) 21:6 Policy Options 51 192

D. Cohen, "The Internal Trade Agreement: Furthering the Canadian Economic Disunion?" (1995) 25 Can. Bus. L.J. 280 197

R. J. Howse, "Between Anarchy and the Rule of Law: Dispute Settlement and Related Implementation Issues in the Agreement on Internal Trade" in M.J. Trebilcock & D. Schwanen, eds., *Getting There: An Assessment of the Agreement on Internal Trade* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1995) 170 at 171-186 209

Re Manganese-Based Fuel Additives Act, File No. 97/99 (June 12, 1998) 216

Re Amendments to Dairy Industry Act Regulations, File No. 98/99 (Jan. 18, 2000) 229

(b) Unilateral Federal Action pursuant to 91(2) and POGG

Hunt v. T & N, [1993] 4 S.C.R. 289 242

R.J. Howse, *Securing the Canadian Economic Union: Legal and Constitutional Options for the Federal Government* (C.D. Howe Institute, 1996) at 3-14 252

(c) Reading 91(2) broadly: dormant commerce clause

K. Swinton, "Courting Out Way to Economic Integration: Judicial Review and the Canadian Economic Union" (1995) 25 Can. Bus. L.J. 280 at 295-302 264

(d) Amending s. 121

A Renewed Canada -- The Report of the Special Joint Committee on a Renewed Canada (1992) (text & proposed amendment to amend s. 121 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*). 269

Charlottetown Accord of 1992, Draft Legal Text, s. 31 (to insert a new s. 36.1 into the *Constitution Act, 1982*). 270

Howse, *Economic Union, Social Justice, and Constitutional Reform: Towards a High But Level Playing Field* at 34-45. 271

Trebilcock & Behboodi, "The Canadian Agreement on Internal Trade: Retrospects and Prospects" at 27-33. 277

VOLUME II

B. International Trade and the Canadian Constitution

1. The *Labour Conventions* controversy

Reference Re Regulation and Control of Aeronautics in Canada, [1932] A.C. 54. 281

Reference re Regulation and Control of Radio Communication in Canada, [1932] A.C. 304. 284

Reference re Weekly Rest in Industrial Undertakings Act, Minimum Wages Act and Limitations of Hours Work Act , [1937] A.C. 326. 287

R. J. Howse, "The *Labour Conventions* Doctrine in an Era of Global Interdependence: Rethinking the Constitutional Dimensions of Canada's External Relations" (1990) at 16 Can. Bus. L.J. 160 at 163-78. 292

2. Jurisdiction to Implement NAFTA

R. Howse, "NAFTA and the Constitution: Does *Labour Conventions* Really Matter Any More?" (1994) 5 Const. Forum 54, excerpts. 301

Anonymous, "Issues of Constitutional Jurisdiction" in Peter M. Leslie & Ronald L. Watts, eds., *Canada: The State of the Federation 1987-88* (Kingston: Queen's University Institute for Intergovernmental Affairs, 1989) 39 at 41-51. 303

3. Impact upon Canadian Federalism

Anonymous, "Issues of Constitutional Jurisdiction", 51-55. 309

Howse, "NAFTA and the Constitution: Does *Labour Conventions* Really Matter Any More?" excerpts. 312

Howse, *Securing the Canadian Economic Union: Legal and Constitutional Options for the Federal Government* at 14-16. 315

IV. AMENDMENT

A. Pre-1982

P. W. Hogg, "Constitutional Law - Amendment of the *British North America Act* - Role of the Provinces" (1982) 60 Can. Bar Rev. 307 at 307-328 1

B. The 1982 Amending Formula

1. Constitutional Provisions

Constitution Act, 1982, Part V. 12

2. Case-Law

Campbell v. Canada (1988), 49 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (B.C.C.A.). 14

Hogan v. Newfoundland (Attorney-General), [1999] N.J. No. 5 (Nfld. S.C.T.D.). 22

3. Commentary

P. Macklem & B. Ryder, "National Interest, National Action: Ottawa Has Power to Initiate Bilateral Process with Quebec" *The Toronto Star* (10 November 1995). 30

K. Swinton, "Amending the Canadian Constitution: Lessons from Meech Lake" (1992) 42 U.T.L.J. 139. 33

A. C. Cairns, "Citizens (Outsiders) and Governments (Insiders) in Constitution-Making: The Case of Meech Lake" (1988) 4 Can. Pub. Pol. S121. 49

4. What is the "Constitution of Canada"?

Constitution Act, 1982, s. 52(2). 62

New Brunswick Broadcasting Co. v. Nova Scotia (Speaker of the House of Assembly), [1993] 1 S.C.R. 319. 63

C. Recent Initiatives and Constitutional Proposals

An Act Respecting Constitutional Amendments, S.C. 1996, c. 1 [*Regional Veto Act*] 67

Constitutional Amendment Approval Act, S.B.C. 1991, c. 2, s. 3(1). 67

Meech Lake Accord of 1987, Schedule, ss. 9-12 (to amend ss. 40, 41, 44, 46 and 47 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*). 68

V. SECESSION

1. Case-Law and Commentary

Reference re Secession of Quebec, [1998] 2 S.C.R. 217. 1

A. Orkin & J. Birenbaum, "The Aboriginal Argument: The Requirement of Aboriginal Consent" in D. Schneiderman, ed., *The Quebec Decision: Perspectives on the Supreme Court Ruling on Secession* (Toronto: James Lortimer, 1999) 83..... 20

2. The *Clarity Act*

An Act to give effect to the requirement for clarity as set out in the opinion of the Supreme Court of Canada in the Quebec Secession Reference, S.C. 2000, c. 26 25

P.J. Monahan, *Doing the Rules* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 2000)..... 28

C. Ryan, *Consequences of the Quebec Secession Reference: The Clarity Bill and Beyond* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 2000)..... 64

3. General

P. J. Monahan, *Cooler Heads Shall Prevail* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1995) 96

R. Simeon, *Limits to Partnership: Canada-Quebec Relations in a Postsecession Era* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1998). 131

P. J. Monahan & M. J. Bryant (with Nancy Coté), *Coming to Terms with Plan B* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1996) at 17-37. 166

P. Russell & B. Ryder, *Ratifying a Postreferendum agreement on Quebec Sovereignty* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1997). 187

4. Specific Topics

(a) Citizenship

S. A. Williams, *International Legal Effects of Secession by Quebec* (North York, ON: York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy, 1992) at 23-29. 216

S. H. Hartt, *Divided Loyalties: Dual Citizenship and Reconstituting the Economic Union* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1995). 220

(b) Debt

P. Boothe & R. Harris, "Alternative Divisions of Federal Assets and Liabilities" in Robin Boadway et al., eds., *Economic Dimensions of Constitutional Change*, vol. 1 (Kingston, ON: John Deutsch Institute for the Study of Economic Policy, 1991) 453 at 453-467 and 470-473..... 235

(c) Economic Association

P. Monahan & L. Covello, *An Agenda for Constitutional Reform* (North York, ON: York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy, 1992) at 105-112..... 244

R. A. Young, *The Secession of Quebec and the Future of Canada*, 2d ed. (Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's Press, 1998) at 29-40 and 60-74 247

(d) Common Currency

Young, *The Secession of Quebec and the Future of Canada* at 41-47 262

5. The Rest of Canada

A. C. Cairns, *Looking into the Abyss: The Need for a Plan C* (Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute, 1997) 266

A. C. Cairns, "Constitutional Change and the Three Equalities" in R. L. Watts & D. M. Brown, eds., *Options for a New Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991) 77 298

R. Howse, "Searching for Plan A: National Unity and the Chretien Government's New Federalism", in H. Lazar, ed., *Non-Constitutional Renewal* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1998) 311 311